POST-PKI: NARRATIVE OF THE FAILURE-BANKRUPT OF INDONESIAN COMMUNISM IN POSTMEMORY LITERARY WORKS

Joko Santoso

Universitas Sarjanawiyata Tamansiswa Yogyakarta
jokosantoso@ustjogja.ac.id

Abstract

The memory of the PKI has always focused on the post-G30S 1965, which positioned the PKI as a victim (genocide); before that, in 1948, the PKI had been a force, a threat, as well as a perpetrator of the murder. Post-PKI was argued as an illustration that communism in Indonesia failed or went bankrupt after the PKI itself came to power. The failure narrative appears in the novels Menggarami Burung Terbang by Sitok Srengenge and the Kubah by Ahmad Tohari. These two authors are the second generation of the 1948 Madiun PKI Rebellion, which in Marianne Hirsch's view, is called the postmemory generation. On the one hand, the narrative is the second generation's response to the PKI's past threats and fear of the same forces and threats in the present. On the other hand, post-PKI became a familial look and a familial gaze in its attempt to project a personal ideology. In turn, the failure narrative emphasizes the factual aspects of the story, not historical facts, because the second generation did not experience direct trauma. In addition, the post-PKI shows the contestation of the ideologies of communism, Islam, and kejawen[1].

Abstrak

Ingatan tentang PKI selalu berfokus pada periode pasca-G30S 1965, yang menggambarkan PKI sebagai korban (genosida); sebelum itu, pada tahun 1948, PKI merupakan kekuatan, ancaman, serta pelaku pembunuhan. Periode pasca-PKI diargumentasikan sebagai ilustrasi bahwa komunisme di Indonesia gagal atau bangkrut setelah PKI sendiri berkuasa. Narasi kegagalan muncul dalam novel Menggarami Burung Terbang karya Sitok Srengenge dan Kubah karya Ahmad Tohari. Kedua penulis ini merupakan generasi kedua dari Pemberontakan PKI Madiun 1948, yang menurut Marianne Hirsch disebut sebagai generasi pasca-ingatan. Di satu sisi, narasi ini merupakan respons generasi kedua terhadap ancaman masa lalu PKI dan ketakutan terhadap kekuatan dan ancaman serupa di masa kini. Di sisi lain, pasca-PKI menjadi pandangan keluarga dan tatapan keluarga dalam upayanya untuk memproyeksikan ideologi pribadi. Narasi kegagalan ini menekankan aspek faktual cerita,

bukan fakta sejarah, karena generasi kedua tidak mengalami trauma langsung. Selain itu, pasca-PKI menunjukkan pertentangan ideologi antara komunisme, Islam, dan kejawen

1. Introduction

Communism began to enter the Dutch East Indies in the period between 1913/1914 under the name Indische Social Democratische Vereniging (ISDV). The figure who initiated the entry of communism was Henk Sneevliet (Kheng, 1992:7; McVey, 2006:13). Seven years later, ISDV was changed to the Communist Party in the Indies (PKH) at the congress in Semarang (Tornquist, 1984:2). Four years later, PKH was changed to the Indonesian Communist Party (PKI) (Adryamarthanino, 2021; Isnaeni, 2020). Under Muso's leadership, the PKI gained power and was considered to be setting up a communist state starting from Madiun. Muso's attempt failed, and President Sukarno described Muso's action as a 'coup.' In 1951, the PKI regained strength under the leadership of Aidit, Njoto, and Lukman (Mortimer, 2006: 13), but in 1965 the PKI was also considered to have carried out a 'coup' with the killing of six army generals in the G30S PKI incident (Mortimer, 2006: 13; Hunter, 2007: 2; Isnaeni, 2020: 6). President Suharto then gave orders to crush the PKI and resulted in the death of hundreds of thousands of PKI members.

Researchers view the 1965 events as genocide, with a record between October 1965 and March 1966 reaching around 500,000 (five hundred thousand) people died (Melvin, 2017; Eickhoff et al., 2017; Leksana, 2019; Cribb, 2001; Cribb, 2002). This murder was even termed "Genocide in Indonesia" or "mechanics of mass murder," which became a painful trauma for the PKI, both victims, and their families. From these events, researchers generally have the same pattern of studies on PKI. *First*, they tend to focus on the 1965 study with the many fatalities already mentioned. *Second*, positioning the PKI as a victim, not as a perpetrator.

However, the PKI had a strong position not only in 1961-1965 but also in 1948 in Madiun. In fact, according to President Sukarno, the PKI 1948, led by Musso, was considered to have carried out a rebellion and wanted to establish a Soviet government in Madiun (Red-Hidup, n.d.: 0). Some literature reveals that in 1948, the PKI killed elite bureaucrats, civil servants, police, soldiers, teachers, organizational leaders, Kiai groups, and village heads (Maksum et al., 1990:ix; PBNU, 2013:9; Poeze, 2020:217). Maarif said that Musso was inspired by the leadership of the communist leader Joseph Stalin. However, Maarif added that Stalin is a figure who must be responsible for tens of millions of his people being killed in Siberian detention, starvation, and disease during his reign, namely 1924-1953 (Gie, 2017:xiii-xiv).

An in-depth study by researchers did not follow the facts about the PKI Madiun 1948. That is, many other possible points can be found. However, unlike in 1965, where living witnesses who had direct memories could still be found, in 1948, living witnesses were already difficult to find due to the long period of the events. An alternative that can be done is information from the second generation, as did Marianne Hirsch in the Holocaust. This paper then limits it to the works of the second generation of literary genres, not works of art or photography as Hirsch did. The reason is that literary works have a more complex substance, and it is hoped that new things will be found than what Hirsch has found. However, Indonesian literary works that contain these events are, in fact, minimal. There

are two literary works that record the events of the PKI Madiun 1948 by the second generation, namely *Menggarami Burung Terbang* (2004) by Sitok Srengenge and *Kubah* (1995) by Ahmad Tohari.

The novel *Menggarami Burung Terbang* describes the narrative of the PKI Madiun incident in 1948 from the views of Guru Dario. This character is often confronted with the main character Ronggo Waskito in arguments or an intense battle of critical opinions on communism within the context of Javanese culture and with religion/God-ness (Srengenge, 2004). Meanwhile, in the novel *Kubah*, such a narrative is depicted in the relationship of Margo's character—an educated character influenced by Musso. As the central figure of the PKI Madiun 1948, Musso instilled his views of communism in Margo, and Margo gave the same influence to the main character of the novel *Kubah*, Karman (Tohari, 2005).

This paper uses Marianne Hirsch's study of postmemory as she wrote in her two crucial books, *Family Frames: Photography, Narrative and Postmemory* (2012) and *The Generation of Postmemory: Writing and Visual Culture after The Holocaust* (2012). Hirsch believes trauma can be inherited; therefore, trauma narratives must be preserved. Although the received memory is not intact, the second generation has invested in imagination, projection, and creation in inheriting trauma from the first generation (Hirsch, 2012a:26). In supporting imagination, projection, and creation, Hirsch sees the tendency of the familial look, a unique point of view that is very personal/familial, as illustrated in his study of Spiegelman comics (*Maus I* and *II*). Hirsch (2012a:26-27) says that Spiegelman views Hitler, the Nazis, and the Holocaust differently. This method is influenced by gaze or personal ideology; in Hirsch's terms, it is referred to as familial gaze. The trauma filled with mass killings and sadism is not to be forgotten but reproduced across generations. It is the same with the Madiun PKI incident in 1948, which later reappeared as a trauma narrative in literary works.

Postmemory in research has developed in various countries. The cruelty of the Franco regime in Spain was written by Saeger (Saeger, 2013). The trauma of the Korean diaspora over the Japanese, Russian, or American wars was written by Seo-Yong Chu (Chu, 2008). NIJOS: an acronym for child victims of the Argentine war written by Gabriela Nouzeilles (Nouzeilles, 2005). The trauma of Latinos with the American Navy was written by Marie Cruz Soto (Soto, 2006). IX Corpus, about the war in Italy and Slovenia written by Alessandra Miklavcic (Miklavcic, 2008). The civil war in Lebanon was written by Craig Larkin and Chrisoula Lionis (Larkin, 2010; Lionis, 2014). The events of the Algerian war massacre were written by Katelyn E. Knox (Knox, 2014). HIJOS and Niños in the Uruguayan dictatorship were written by Cara Levey (Levey, 2014). American and Iraq War were written by Jennifer Bowening Delisle (Delisle, 2013). The trauma of female slavery in African-American history is written by (Keizer, 2008). The events of the Korean Demilitarized Zone (DMZ) were written by Youngmin Choe (Choe, 2013). The Partition of India event was written by Ananya Jahanara Kabir (Kabir, 2004). Vietnam War refugee trauma is written by Long Bui (Bui, 2016). The postmemory studies that Chu has carried out, Nouzeilles, Soto, Larkin, Lionis, Knox, Levey, Delisle, Keizer, Coe, Kabir, and Bui mentioned above are based on traumatic events such as the 1948 PKI Madiun incident is a narrative of trauma that was formed in the Madiun PKI incident in 1948 in postmemory works, namely *Menggarami Burung Terbang* and the *Kubah*.

2. Method

In addition to postmemory theory, this paper employs a new-insights-based method of analysis (Flick, 2007; Faruk, 2012; Moleong, 2017). The initial step is to categorize Islamic motifs in Musso's narration of the trauma against the PKI. The works of Tere Liye,

Anab Afifi, and Thowaf Zuharon feature this character. The following step is to compare literary texts with PKI historical texts to obtain an interpretation of the punctum, specifically the wounding narrative (Hirsch opens up the opportunity to read the punctum not only in pictures and photos, but also works of fiction). The character Musso is a metonymy of PKI Madiun 1948; therefore, in this step, the historical text of PKI Madiun 1948 is required to determine how Musso appears in a fictional narrative and how he appears in a factual (historical) narrative. In addition to the history of the PKI Madiun 1948, the narrative of the PKI 1965 from two scholarly works, namely Budiawan and Herlambang, is compared so that the pattern of the second generation of Islam such as Tere Liye, Anab Afifi, and Thowaf Zuharon as subalterns in constructing their narrative subjectivity can be observed. This implies that the "world seen," as Barthes stated, must be discussed in greater depth by entering the "world of the PKI." The subsequent step is to abstract the punctum's interpretation into the essence of the 1948 PKI trauma, which demonstrates how Islam and Musso became the narrative force of the second generation, as seen in Tere Liye, Anab Afifi, and Thowaf Zuharon. The further realization of these conclusions will constitute new insight.

Based on the type of qualitative data, namely *Menggarami Burung Terbang* and *Kubah*, data analysis can be carried out back and forth to achieve maximum coherence. Faruk said that the validity of the research results with this method is determined based on the degree or level of complete coherence that can be achieved in the relationship between parts and the whole text, or vice versa (Faruk, 2012: 167). Trauma narrative data from *Menggarami Burung Terbang* and *Kubah* were analyzed for continuous improvement (Moleong, 2017: 95). Data analysis is not rigorous but seeks to gain new perspectives (the ways of seeing) and new insights (the practice of senses). Flick mentions that what is needed is creativity in concepts and theories to design the methodology (Flick, 2007: 64). Therefore, as stated by Faruk, Flick, and also Moleong, data analysis in *Menggarami Burung Terbang* and *Kubah* is done back and forth, creatively, not rigor or strict, so that new perspectives can be found, or in other words, a narrative of trauma that has never been seen before.

3. Discussion
a. Post-PKI, Ordinary People, and Islam

Hirsch said that Spiegelmann had successfully re-narrated Hitler's racial atrocities against the Jewish nation by depicting a critical fable in the comic *Maus*. This narrative pattern shows that the second generation does not rigorously use historical views but uses an investment of imagination and creation. Like Spiegelmann, in *Menggarami Burung Terbang* and the *Kubah*, Sitok Srengenge, and Ahmad Tohari as the second generation, The PKI Madiun incident in 1948 brought back the trauma of the event in a different narrative pattern. Srengenge and Tohari narrate a bankruptcy or failure of the views of communism in Indonesia. Communist figures in his work appear as historical figures in the past. Still, these figures are opposed to other figures with views that expose the bankruptcy and failure of communism in Indonesia at that time.

There are at least two things that Srengenge and Tohari described Indonesian communism (PKI) in 1948. *First*, the PKI is a threat to the Indonesian people because of the spirit of revolution, which has always aspired to lead to civil war. *Second*, the PKI did not accept the principle of belief other than human strength, which means that the power of religion or belief in God does not exist. *Third*, the ideals of revolution and human power eventually went bankrupt and failed, a condition that can be termed post-PKI. In this

section, Srengenge and Tohari show the post-PKI pattern in two different ways: post-PKI and the essence of the ordinary people; and post-PKI and Islam. The post-PKI shows that communism, in turn, did not significantly influence the belief in the essential views of the ordinary people and the teachings of Islam.

b. Post-PKI and the Essence of the Ordinary People

Sitok Srengenge, in the novel *Menggarami Burung Terbang* uses a narrator who has a third point of view, and the character Ronggo Waskito who has a first-person point of view to show the threat, bankruptcy, and failure of the PKI to the Javanese people (the ordinary). For Srengenge, the PKI and the ideals of the revolution were grandiose and inaccessible, and the limited understanding of the lower classes of society led to conflicts and wars. This revolution looks contradictory; on the one hand, the revolution that Guru Dario fights in the novel is pretexted to be aimed at the people's interests, but on the other hand, the so-called revolution is far from the reach of the people. This problem can be seen in the following quote.

You don't want the harmony between your neighbors to fade just because of different understanding choices. You liken the people of your village to a bunch of betel vines, and you don't want the commotion in bearing the hardships and joys to disperse. You think that the people in your village don't need the presence of characters from the puppet (*wayang*) world. No Antasena[2]. There is no Gatutkaca[3]. And Antareja[4] was not there. Even if they are called a parable, the lifeline has established your village people as clowns. And you know, even in the wayang tales, no clowns turn into royalty.

You confirmed your intention to revive the Gambus Irama Suksma Orchestra group as an association free from the interference of various interests. You can imagine that the group will serve one of them. An artistic troupe, by all, for all. Let the members participate in their party organizations and practice dancing and singing, but in your orchestra, you will not allow them to perform the dances and songs of the parties (Srengenge, 2004:301-302).

There is a belief from Srengenge that the people do not have to be "powerful" as in the puppet characters; Antasena, Gatutkaca, and Antareja[5]. Srengenge even said that the people must still be the people (punakawan[6]) in general and do not have to be nobles, queens, kings, or the like. From this, we can see two different models of the ordinary people: the people who are positioned as the status quo; and the people who are set as the movers/tools of the revolution. One thing represents Srengenge's view, and the other represents the PKI's (Guru Dario) view.

The ordinary people, as the status quo, have the virtue of "*guyub-seikat sirih serumpun serai*" namely the concept of harmony, togetherness, and community typical of villages in social life. Srengenge calls it a "lifeline" or, in other words, destiny, something that has been determined by life (and may not be changed anymore). Because of a decree, the advent of communist views threatens that destiny. Communism allows the emergence of interests that encourage ordinary people to move from their social future. This matter can be seen in the following quote.

"But what can country humans like us do?" Ronggo sans.

---

[2] Figure in Javanese Puppet Story
[3] Figure in Javanese Puppet Story
[4] Figure in Javanese Puppet Story
[5] Characters in puppet fairy tales who can hardly be killed without a ruse.
[6] Characters in puppet who describe the story from the point of view of the ordinary people.

> *"It would be a waste if we act on our own. But if we unite, move in unison, we will be able to detonate what Bung Kusno calls re-vo-lu-si (revolution)."*

> *Anxiety began to creep into Ronggo Waskito's mind. No matter how many hundred times he had heard the word revolution uttered in stuttering speeches, the echoes seemed to have become the scent of the air that all the people inhaled at any moment. A word that not only sounds foreign but also invites meanings that are often confusing. It is not easy for a village-like Ronggo to imagine a tremendous change that will occur in a short time, but at the same time, it is also touted as a never-ending transition* (Srengenge, 2004:208-209).

Communism offers revolution for change; among them is for the rights of the people, in the understanding that certain powers have controlled communism. As seen in the quote above, Bung Kusno figures often say this revolution should be suspected as Bung Karno (proclaimer of Indonesian independence). For Ronggo Waskito, the revolution has become out of reach for the villagers/ordinary. The term became foreign, and changing from revolutionary ideals to wishful thinking was hard to imagine. The revolution requires the people to unite, to move in unison so that the revolution can explode. In contrast, they (the village community) are already connected (*guyub-seikat sirih serumpun serai*) before the revolution is heard.

In the context of the novel *Menggarami Burung Terbang*, Srengenge describes that what drives the lives of ordinary people is hope. The expectation is universal and not singular. Everything that offers hope can be accepted in the village community, whether religion, politics, or ideology. Srengenge insists that acceptance of these expectations is not competitive; one expectation with another is not contradicted. In other words, religion, politics, and ideology are not opposed to each other but accepted as a hope. Faith does not have to conflict with communism and vice versa. Srengenge, through Ronggo Waskito, said:

> *"Religious parties they accept because they give hope for the happiness of heaven, after suffering in this world. The Communist Party came with a promise to end the world's suffering by eliminating differences in levels to be replaced with equality of dignity in the social system of life* (Srengenge, 2004:226-227)".

The quote raises at least two expectations: the hope of heavenly bliss and the hope of equal dignity. One thing was offered by religion, and another by the communists (PKI). Ronggo Waskito added: "… *They received everything as long as they gave hope. One and the other cannot cancel each other out* (Srengenge, 2004:226-227)" It can be understood that these hopes unite, not separate.

> *You get restless whenever you think about how difficult it is to realize such an idea. Whoever holds power will certainly not remain silent if his passion is to be transferred. After all, it is only one idea, and there are many other ideas from other thinkers and party leaders, each of which sounds noble and always acts in the name of the ordinary people. What will happen if all parties stick to their ideas (you always end your wandering mind with a question)? And now I feel that stubbornness is starting to infect your neighbors. Every association seems to be preparing to advance to compete in Padang Kurusetra[7]* (Srengenge, 2004:301).

---

[7] battlefield in Mahabarata's puppet story

Srengenge, as the second generation of postmemory of the 1948 PKI Madiun Rebellion, said that the ideas offered by the PKI threatened the togetherness of the ordinary people. The idea of a revolution by encouraging the ordinary people to move together and unite to overthrow power is an idea that will lead to division and war (competing against *Padang Kurusetra*). This matter illustrates that the PKI experienced bankruptcy and the failure of post-1948 ideas, according to Srengenge. Through this novel, Srengenge feels the need and responsibility to convey to the next generation that the concept of PKI communism in 1948 had undergone a post-PKI experience, where the ordinary people essentially wanted a "hope" but instead were faced with division and war. In other words, the Post-PKI also became an essential ideological view for Srengenge that communism, either as an ideology or as a party (PKI), could not bring hope to the ordinary people. This problem can be seen in another quote below.

> *...*
> *For Ronggo Waskito, that tragic death only deserves to be remembered and forgotten and remembered so that it doesn't happen again. In his heart, Ronggo promised that he would never plunge himself into war again, whatever the reason for the war and whatever risk he had to take due to the rejection. And now, Guru Dario—imitating great men whose lives were alien to the realities of ordinary people's life—initiated a revolution. In the past, the revolution was ignited by a war against foreign colonialism until our independence was marked by the transfer of power and others in the shortest possible time. But, in every speech, Bung Kusno always emphasized that the revolution was not over. What kind of revolution is unfinished? And if there must be another war for a revolution, who is the enemy, if not brothers? For Ronggo there is only one answer: abstinence* (Srengenge, 2004:2016).

Srengenge, through Ronggo Waskito in the quote above, shows his rejection of Guru Dario's view of the communist revolution. After successfully resisting the colonial invaders, the revolution was considered unfinished. The unfinished phrase indicates a conceptual continuity. This revolution for Srengenge became abstract because it was not the colonial invaders being fought against but the brothers themselves. This revolution is also considered bankruptcy or failure because the civil war for Srengenge is: do not do it.

Srengenge was seen using a subjective and tendentious point of view to expose the bankruptcy and failure of the PKI. The communist revolution is considered to have created opposition, so according to Srengenge, the hope of achieving equality of dignity has not been completed. In addition to the failure of the revolution, the post-PKI is also described as failing to have a significant ideological influence on the ordinary people/village communities. Post-PKI is thus closely related to subjectivity as Hirsch believes that personal experience is also a research laboratory. This matter can be seen in the following quote.

> *In the evening, after sunset, the male guests' turn was to arrive wearing skullcaps, shirts, and sarongs. Most don't go straight from home; they come from mosques or surau[8]. Their appearance not only explained that in the way of dressing, men experienced more changes than women who still adhered to customary rules but also emphasized that even though the Communist Party had begun to gain sympathy from some villagers, its teachings were unable to change their views and beliefs them about religion* (Srengenge, 2004:226)**.**

---

[8] a little mosque

In the quote above, Srengenge shows the post-PKI related to communism and religion, especially Islam as a view or teaching. Islam is considered to have strong roots in rural communities/ordinary people compared to communism/communist parties. In other words, the hope offered by Islam is more successful than the communism/communist party.

Post-PKI in the novel *Menggarami Burung Terbang* is marked by various bankruptcies and failures of the post-1948 Indonesian Communist Party. *First*, the ordinary people, defended by the communists as the driving force/tool of the revolution, were faced with the people who hoped for a peaceful communal space (*guyub*). It was considered that the ordinary people did not need to carry out any movement as the idea of a communist revolution if it eventually led to division. *Second*, revolution is abstract, while togetherness, a peaceful community, is something the ordinary people previously owned. Efforts to fight for the revolution became out of reach for the ordinary people. *Third*, communism failed to influence the people regarding the religion of Islam. The revolutionary hope of communism, namely equality of dignity, has no more effect on the hope of paradise in Islam.

c. Post-PKI and Islam

Ahmad Tohari also describes the bankruptcy and failure of the PKI post-1948 in the novel *Kubah*. Post-PKI was seen in the revolutionary and progressive contestation of the determination of communism with an open and passive acceptance of Islam. Communism, through Karman and his communist groups, attacks Islam with all ideas and views on social aspects, while Islam is described as a spiritual and psychological bulwark. Tohari points out that the social determination of the communists is only an act of far less value than belief and belief as a spiritual and psychological bulwark. This problem can be seen in the following quote.

> *With all his might, Karman tried to understand Captain Somad's words. Condition? Do I have to qualify if I want to get a cure for the emptiness in my soul? Thought Karman. "Well, hear what I mean by that condition. You must start with belief to base your healing efforts on your soul. Yes, trust."*
> *"Trust?" interrupted Karman.*
> *"Yes, the belief that great power is ruling over you. That power transcends whatever is within you. Anyway, you have very little control over yourself. Indeed, you can explain with the power of your mind, for example, why it came to inhabit this place. But at the limit, you will fall helpless. A few days ago, you intended to destroy yourself because you couldn't understand something happening to you. That is clear evidence of your powerlessness* (Tohari, 2005:25-26).

The quote illustrates that there are forces that drive humans to live or survive; the strength that is outside of man and the strength within man. Communism, through Karman, is described as believing in the power within humans (sense/logic) and rejecting any other authority besides that (outside humans). However, through Captain Somad, Islam bases strength not from within man but outside himself, and that power has power over the man himself. Communism is considered wrong in applying the principle from which power and power come. That mistake destroyed the gap for communism, namely "self-destruction." Post-PKI, described by Karman, is how the self can be destroyed if you don't trust or believe in great powers and powers outside of yourself. Another quote is as follows.

"Well, you're a former atheist; can you organize your inner attitude? Can you put belief above the power of your mind? That's what I meant."

Karman bowed; Lord. Oh, yes. What Captain Somad meant was the belief in the existence of God. During his time as a party member, Karman was encouraged to throw away all faith in anything that was not material. His party's teachings say that what is immaterial is nonsense. God is only there for those who think he exists. And the instructions of his party also say that if there is something that can be called God, then he is the party itself. And revolution! (Tohari, 2005:26).

Post-PKI post-1948 is depicted in an ideological contestation about the forces that drive people to live and survive. Communism believes that sense is the source of strength, while Islam believes in God as power. Sense encouraged the birth of the revolution and the delivery of the party (PKI), all of which were based on things that were: materialism. For Karman and communism, immaterial things are nonsensical or non-sense, including God. This matter, for Tohari, as the second generation of the 1948 PKI Madiun Rebellion Incident, was a severe threat to Islam because communism does not know God except for revolution and parties, while Islam teaches submission to the power of God. This power makes no sense for communism. In addition to threats, Tohari also sees that human beings are related to their God. Although communism considers sense more concrete than God, as depicted in Karman, God is present in him. This problem can be seen in the following quote.

Karman kept his head down. There is an honesty that slowly develops in him. He wanted to sincerely confess, even though he had been a member of the communist party for a long time, that God's presence was still felt in him. Karman never managed to force himself. Karman has never succeeded in forcing himself to believe that God is the same as bullshit. And that even though he has been with the communist party for a long time, Karman wants to be understood through other channels (Tohari, 2005:26).

Karman is a representation of the post-PKI, where communism failed to control the whole human being with the power of sense. Apart from sense, there is a mental space, feeling, which cannot negate the presence of God. Logically, perhaps communism has succeeded in molding Karman into an ideological human who is obedient to the revolution, but psychologically and emotionally, Karman still thinks that God exists. This matter is what happened to the post-PKI, namely the bankruptcy and failure of communism itself, as seen in another quote.

Then Karman looked at Captain Somad with sad eyes.

"Captain, I can easily accept the conditions put forward. Yes, although I am ashamed to say it, I still believe in God in my life. But the fact that the Captain put forward such conditions makes me sad."

Captain Somad felt poked. But the officer was quick to smile.

"Then, forgive me. And, well, let's get started now. Before death comes, everyone will experience one of three trials: difficulty in obtaining sustenance, poor health, and the loss of loved ones. What is happening to you now, I think, is a combination of the three trials of life. Incredible indeed. However, a way out is always available if you believe and surrender to God. So, only belief in the greatness and love of God can make you calm, not feel in vain (Tohari, 2005:27).

Tohari, through the character of Captain Somad, also touched on the issue of a crucial obstacle to human life, namely death. Post-PKI was shown by its failure to overcome the problem of death, which Captain Somad characterized by three things; difficulty in obtaining sustenance, poor health, and loss of loved ones. Karman is evidence of a demonstrated failure. Karman cannot understand sustenance, health, and being ostracized from those closest to him as signs of death. This problem can only be solved with God's help, and communism could not solve it with Karman's downfall after 1948. This matter proves that Tohari not only compares Islam with communism but also dismantles communism. Other quotes are as follows.

Can my words reach your heart?"
"A little, Captain."
*When you feel in a very dark mind when you feel completely helpless, there are truly hands reaching out to you. The first hand represents God's help, and the other represents an evil power that wills your destruction. You can say who led you to despair and convince yourself that this is the best way. Do not follow the invitation of the destructive power. You better listen to the voice of your conscience because he can see the way that God likes. Follow that path, because with Him all suffering becomes light or even non-existen*t (Tohari, 2005:27-28)."

Islamic religious interests target humans when faced with death and its signs, namely the heart. In this context, there are human concepts, each of which is offered. *First*, communism does not offend the heart as the center of human self-control and power. Karman calls it "God" if necessary to mention God is the reason, lies within man himself, and attempts to use sense for a significant change in human injustice, namely revolution. Thus, the sense is the top center of the power of communism. *Second*, Islam positions God at the peak of strength and control over human beings, which is located (in fact) outside of humans. One way to infuse the energy and power of God into human beings is to believe and believe. This process of acknowledging and accepting cannot be done with the sense (because communism claims this to be insensible) but uses the heart and feelings.

Karman, as quoted in Tohari's novel, is described as experiencing a meltdown due to bankruptcy and post-1948 failure, and it is centered on a crisis of feelings, psyche, and heart. Islam in Tohari's novel describes that the mind, body, and material will be damaged, helpless, not functioning, or die if the feelings/spirit/heart are damaged. For Tohari in the novel, humans need to prioritize using feelings/spirits/hearts that believe in God before using sense. This concept seems to be the opposition between the heart and the mind. Post-PKI in Tohari's novel reveals that communism, like Karman (and possible communists at that time), concentrated on sharpening sense and revolution but dulling hearts and conscience. There are two destructions according to Islam in the post-PKI; namely, humans who do not believe in God and humans experience damage to feelings/soul/conscience. Tohari felt the need and responsibility for the next generation of the threat of communism. Another quote can be seen as follows.

And there, Kasstagethek still sat solemnly. In the realization that when the image of the firing squad appeared before his eyes, Karman felt very jealous of Kasstagethek with all his very calm, flowing, and submissive behavior. Karman can confirm that Kastagethek's serenity in life is related to his prayers, remembrance, and tasbih[9].

---

[9] glorify the name of God

"Ah, I have long since denied the three rites and discarded them. (Tohari, 2005:151-152)."

When fear began to grip his heart, Karman had time to think about Kasstagethek. His calm. And sincerity to live life. Karman is jealous. In the past, in discussions organized by the party, people like Kasstagethek were often used as examples of people being oppressed by the exploiting class. "I can say that an unjust social system causes the poverty experienced by Caste and millions of people like him. Because they are poor, they become weak and stupid. Furthermore, ignorance regenerates poverty. Thus, poverty, ignorance, and weakness have formed a closed chain so that there is a vicious circle that can no longer be seen at the beginning. And the oppressing class uses religion as opium to lull the oppressed into complacency and not demand their social rights (Tohari, 2005:161).

Furthermore, through the Kasstagethek figure, the post-PKI is described as contradictory to the question of justice. Communism believes that justice is outside of human beings, is in the complexity of the social system, and must be fought for to make it happen. The little people are targets for this injustice. However, Tohari describes the life of Kasstagethek (who in communism is often discussed as the oppressed people) as someone who represents justice from within himself. Kasstagethek is a devout Muslim. Suppose communism in the novel says that religion is opium and lulls someone to demand social rights for injustice. In that case, according to Islam, Kasstagethek finds justice from calm and submission in worship. In this case, the post-PKI is shown with a contradictory view of Islam by the idea of communism. For Kasstagethek and followers of Islam, justice starts with oneself, and religion provides guidelines for obtaining that justice.

… Kasstagethek sang the song Sangkan-paraning dumadi; where and where are you going?

I used to be gone
Now I exist
Soon I will be gone
Back to divine grace

…

Yes. As a child, Karman had complete faith in the teaching that everything that exists comes from God and will return to God. However, after becoming a party member, such faith was thrown away under the influence of Margo and their friends. For Margo, who Karman later followed, all things that exist must exist, and there is no need to ask where they came from and where they came. "Everything comes into existence and then becomes nothing, all because of historical dialectics" (Tohari, 2005:153).

From the Kasstagethek figure, Tohari further describes the post-PKI by emphasizing the Islamic view of human origins and death. There are several views regarding origin and death, as illustrated in the quote above. Communism rejects the question of man's origin and the man's purpose: *"... all things that exist must exist, and there is no need to ask where they came from and where they are going."* Human existence, according to communism, is existence as it is like other creatures, namely in the perspective of material, form, or material. Because of this, people don't need to ask where they come from and where they are headed. Human existence and non-existence is a kind of historical dialectic utterly unrelated to things outside historical civilization.

The opposite is shown in Kasstagethek's verse: "// *I used to be gone//Now I exist//In the future I will be gone//Return to divine grace//*." The poem describes that humans were created, not as they are. Because they were made, humans have their origins from their creator. This concept is different from the concept of communism which is a strong sense of why communism itself is a threat to Islam. Man in Islam depends on his creator's will and identifies death as a phase of returning to his creator, not as a historical dialectic as in communism. Meanwhile, communism identifies humans as having the power to live. Death for communism as a historical record that humans die will be replaced by the next generation—death means finished, there is no life after death, nor is it dependent on the will of its creator.

Post-PKI and Islam show once again that communism is no better than Islam. This view is indeed tendentious, shown by Tohari through his novel characters with the responsibility of dismantling the bankruptcy and failure of post-1948 communism. This responsibility can be said to be a recall effort and, at the same time, a representation of ideological views such as the familial gaze that: humans have had to depend on their creator since the first time they were born; humans do not exist if they are not "existed," not humans exist as they should be; humans have many weaknesses and limits, the one who can exceed the limits and cover those weaknesses is the creator; humans die because they return to their creator, not because they have finished their lives as a historical dialectic.

4. Conclusion

The novel *Menggarami Burung Terbang* by Sitok Srengenge shows the post-PKI tendency towards the essence of the ordinary people and the concept of revolution. Srengenge exposed the bankruptcy and failure of the post-1948 PKI by describing that; *first*, the ordinary people essentially do not feel the need to be defended as the oppressed as long as they can adhere to the principle of harmony; *secondly*, the ordinary people are not the movers/tools of the revolution, or at least have failed to become a tool of the revolution because it has led to civil war and division; *third*, revolution becomes a discourse that the ordinary people do not reach, and instead becomes the antithesis of people's harmony.

Then, the novel *Kubah* by Ahmad Tohari shows the post-PKI tendency toward Tohari's efforts to dismantle communism as a threat to Islam. The bankruptcy and failure of the PKI are seen in Tohari's tendencies in view; *first*, humans have had to depend on their creator from the moment they were born; *second*, humans do not exist if they are not "exist," not humans exist as they should be; *third*, humans have many weaknesses and limits, the one who can exceed the limits and cover those weaknesses are the creator; *fourth*, humans die because they return to their creator, not because they have finished their lives as historical dialectics.

References

Adryamarthanino, V. (2021). *PKI: Asal-usul, Pemilu, Pemberontakan, Tokoh, dan Pembubaran*. Kompas.

Bui, L. (2016). The Refugee Repertoire: Performing and Staging the Postmemories of Violence. *Melusus*, *41*(3), 112–132.

Choe, Y. (2013). Postmemory DMZ in South Korean Cinema, 1999-2003. *The Journal of Korean Studies*, *18*(2), 315–336.

Chu, S. (2008). Science Fiction and Postmemory Han in Contemporary Korean American

Literature. *Melus*, *33*(4), 97–121.

Cribb, R. (2001). Genocide in Indonesia, 1965-1966. *Journal of Genocide Research*, *3*(2), 219–239. https://doi.org/10.1080/713677655.

Cribb, R. (2002). Unresolved problems in the Indonesian killings of 1965-1966. *Asian Survey*, *42*(4), 550–563. https://doi.org/10.1525/as.2002.42.4.550.

Delisle, J. B. (2013). "Iraq in My Bones": Second-Generation Memory in The Age of Global Media. *Biography*, *36*(2), 376–391.

Eickhoff, M., van Klinken, G., & Robinson, G. (2017). 1965 Today: Living with the Indonesian Massacres. *Journal of Genocide Research*, *19*(4), 449–464. https://doi.org/10.1080/14623528.2017.1393931.

Faruk. (2012). *Metode Penelitian Sastra: Sebuah Penjelajahan Awal*. Pustaka Pelajar.

Flick, U. (2007). *Designing Qualitative Research*. Sage Publications.

Gie, S. H. (2017). *Orang-orang di Persimpangan Kiri Jalan*. Mata Bangsa.

Hirsch, M. (2012). *Family Frames: Photography Narrative and Postmemory*. Harvard University Press.

Hunter, H.-L. (2007). *Sukarno And The Indonesian Coup: The Untold Story*. Praeger Security International.

Isnaeni, H. F. (2020). *Sejarah PKI yang Tak Sempat Tua*. Historia. https://historia.id/politik/articles/sejarah-pki-yang-tak-sempat-tua-D8wm6.

Kabir, A. J. (2004). Musical Recall: Postmemory and the Punjabi Diaspora. *Journal of Comparative Poetic*, *24*, 172–189.

Keizer, A. R. (2008). Gone Astray in the Flesh: Kara Walker, Black Women Writers, and African American Postmemory. *PMLA*, *123*(5), 1649–1672. https://doi.org/10.1632/pmla.2008.123.5.1649.

Kheng, C. B. (1992). From PKI to The Comintern, 1924-1941: The Apprenticeship of the Malayan Communist Party. In *ELT Journal* (Vol. 58, Issue 3). SEAP. https://doi.org/10.1093/elt/58.3.274.

Knox, K. E. (2014). Rapping Postmemory, Sampling the Archive: Reimagining 17 October 1961. *Modern & Contemporary France*, *22*(3), 381–397. https://doi.org/10.1080/09639489.2014.885004.

Larkin, C. (2010). Beyond The War? The Lebanese Postmemory Experience. *Int.J.Middle East Stud*, *42*, 615–635. https://doi.org/10.1017/S002074381000084X.

Leksana, G. (2019). Remembering the Indonesian Genocide, 53 Years Later. *Bijdragen Tot de Taal-, Land- En Volkenkunde*, *175*(1), 67–79. https://doi.org/10.1163/22134379-17501001.

Levey, C. (2014). Of HIJOS and Niños: Revisiting postmemory in post-dictatorship Uruguay. *History and Memory*, *26*(2), 5–39. https://doi.org/10.1353/ham.2014.0010.

Lionis, C. (2014). A Past Not Yet Passed: Postmemory in the Work of Mona Hatoum. *Social Text*, *32*(2), 77–93. https://doi.org/10.1215/01642472-2419558.

Maksum, Sunyoto, A., & Zainuddin, A. (1990). *Lubang-Lubang Pembantaian: Petualangan PKI di Madiun 1948*. Jawa Pos dan Pustaka Utama Grafiti.

McVey, R. T. (2006). The Rise of Indonesian Communism. In *The Rise of Indonesian Communism*. Equinox. https://doi.org/10.7591/9781501742651.

Melvin, J. (2017). Mechanics of Mass Murder: A Case for Understanding the Indonesian Killings as Genocide. *Journal of Genocide Research*, *19*(4), 487–511. https://doi.org/10.1080/14623528.2017.1393942.

Miklavcic, A. (2008). Slogans and graffiti: Postmemory among youth in the Italo – Slovenian borderland. *American Ethnologist*, *35*(3), 440–453.

https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1548-1425.2008.00045.x.

Moleong, L. J. (2017). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. PT Remaja Rosdakarya.

Mortimer, R. (2006). *Indonesian Communism Under Sukarno: Ideology and Politics 1959-1965*. Equinox.

Nouzeilles, G. (2005). Postmemory Cinema and the Future of the past in Albertina Carri's Los Rubios. *Journal of Latin American Cultural Studies: Travesia*, *14*(3), 263–278. https://doi.org/10.1080/13569320500382500.

PBNU, T. (2013). *Benturan NU-PKI 1948 -1965*. PBNU.

Poeze, H. A. (2020). *Madiun 1948 PKI Bergerak*. Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia dan KITLV.

Red-Hidup. (n.d.). *Madiun: Sama Rata ala P.K.I. Musso*. Unitas.

Saeger, J. M. (2013). Memory and Postmemory in Lidia Falcón ' s Play "Las mujeres caminaron con el fuego del siglo." *Hispania*, *96*(3), 515–524.

Soto, M. C. (2006). The killing of Mapepe: Performing postmemory in late twentieth century Vieques, Puerto Rico. *Journal of Iberian and Latin American Studies*, *12*(1), 1–22. https://doi.org/10.1080/13260219.2006.10426840.

Srengenge, S. (2004). *Menggarami Burung Terbang*. Metafor.

Tohari, A. (2005). *Kubah*. Gramedia Pustaka.

Tornquist, O. (1984). *Dilemmas of third world communism: The Destruction of the PKI in Indonesia*. Zed Books.